



Design Review Board

Minutes

August 9, 2016
Council Chambers – Lower Level
57 East 1st Street
4:30 PM

A work session of the Design Review Board was held at the City of Mesa Council Chamber – Lower Level, 57 East 1st Street at 4:30 p.m.

Board Members Present:

Sean Banda – Chair
Tracy Roedel – Vice Chair
Taylor Candland
Brian Sandstrom
Randy Carter
Nicole Thompson

Board Members Absent:

Eric Paul

Staff Present:

Andrew Spurgin
Tom Ellsworth
Kim Steadman
Lesley Davis
Mia Lozano
Rebecca Gorton

Others Present:

Toby Rogers

Chair Banda welcomed everyone to the Work Session at 4:30 p.m.

- A. Discuss and Provide Direction Regarding Design Review cases:

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
August 9, 2016**

Item A.1. DR16-011 Expansion of A.T. Still

LOCATION/ADDRESS: 5850 – 5959 E. Still Circle
REQUEST: Review of an academic building and parking garage
COUNCIL DISTRICT: 2
OWNER: Kirksville College of Osteopathic Medicine IN
APPLICANT: Toby Rogers, Butler Design Group
ARCHITECT: Jeffrey Cutberth
STAFF PLANNER: Andrew Spurgin, AICP

Continued from the July 12, 2016 meeting

Discussion: Andrew Spurgin, AICP presented the Board with an overview of the updates to the project. Applicant Toby Rogers, Butler Design Group, reviewed the changes that were made to the design from comments that the Board made at the last meeting.

Boardmember Thompson

- Suggested color change on panels based on the material board
- Suggested addition of random panels to break up monotony
- Suggested toning down the long linear piece of brow
- Feels that changing angles and material of panels occasionally will help

Applicant responded that the angle of panels and type of perforated openings could change.

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Feels that there needs to be a theme to tie back to rest of campus
- Feels that there is no consistency
- Feels that the garage elevation seems arbitrary and not connected to campus
- Stated he likes the corner piece but the middle just sort of runs on
- Suggested use of backlit LED on the corners with a soft glow and not washing it with light

Boardmember Carter

- Inquired about the white panels on the west elevation of garage. Applicant responded with explanation of placing identity graphics on garage
- Stated that if Board of Adjustment does not approve signage, the project needs to come back to DR

Vice Chair Roedel

- Feels that the middle of the east elevation of garage is haphazard

Chair Banda

- Feels that the elevations are better than last time
- Likes the perforated materials and accent corners
- Inquired about lighting and suggested soft lighting on corners to light up the garage
- Suggested carrying sandstone element to east side

Staff will work with applicant to finalize design.

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
August 9, 2016**

Item A.2. DR16-020

Avilla Lehi

LOCATION/ADDRESS: 3400 – 3600 block of East Thomas Road
REQUEST: Review of a multi-residence
COUNCIL DISTRICT: 1
OWNER: Rodney and Janelle Engel
APPLICANT: Brennan Ray, Burch & Cracchiolo, PA
ARCHITECT: Dave Soltysik, Terrascape Consulting
STAFF PLANNER: Kim Steadman

Continuance to September 13, 2016 Meeting

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
August 9, 2016**

Item A.3. DR16-021 Saranac Offices

LOCATION/ADDRESS: 5253 S. Saranac
REQUEST: Review of an office building
COUNCIL DISTRICT: 6
OWNER: Granite Investments, LLC
APPLICANT: Design Professionals, LLC
ARCHITECT: John C. Manross
STAFF PLANNER: Lesley Davis

Discussion: Staff member Lesley Davis presented the Board with an overview of the project and stated that the site is located behind existing buildings and lacks visibility from the street. Ms. Davis stated that the project is here before the Board because of the size of the building and not the location. The only change made by the applicant from the last meeting are the use of different materials and the colors remain the same.

Chair Banda

- Feels that the center element read a lot better than the previous elevation especially with glass carrying through
- Suggested it still need to bookend buildings
- Stated he is not a fan of the scored block
- Suggested carrying awnings all the way across
- Feels masonry over stocked stone could be better
- Feels the color has a good feeling
- Stated that the Board comments were not addressed
- Stated they addressed center element well but the main part of the building does not read well

Vice Chair Roedel

- Clarified it is stacked stone

Boardmember Thompson

- Stated that previous comments still apply.
- Feels that the materials are not good
- Stated she likes color on the material board
- Stated she does not like synthetic stone

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Feels that each side entry reads like a parking garage without the awnings
- Feels that the date palms work because they break up un-bookended feel
- Stated the design has to think of area and a design that works
- Suggested that masonry be used and pulled up and wrap the top of the tower
- Suggested adding more mass

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
August 9, 2016**

- Suggested bringing depth and significance to the building
- Articulate the perimeter
- Looks like spandrel panels in a parking garage.

Boardmember Carter

- Stated that this Board has the ability to improve the architecture in Mesa
- Stated this design does not meet BIZ requirements
- Inquired why awnings are on 2nd floor and feels high awnings will not help

The Board requested that the project be back to the Board for review with the changes discussed.

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
August 9, 2016**

Item A.4. DR16-022 Red Mountain Business Park

LOCATION/ADDRESS: 3410 N. Higley
REQUEST: Review of a warehouse
COUNCIL DISTRICT: 5
OWNER: Higley Land Investments, LLC
APPLICANT: Corey Smith, DCSJ, LLC
ARCHITECT: Don Christensen
STAFF PLANNER: Tom Ellsworth

Discussion: Staff member Tom Ellsworth presented the Board with an overview of the project.

Chair Banda

- Suggested applicant consider aspects of the Dexcom building at Dobson and Broadway and US60 and Horne
- Suggested adding texture in the panel but not overdoing it
- Suggested texture in the recessed elements and not in pop outs
- Likes the banding
- Suggested use of precast with waves with form liner

Boardmember Carter

- Feels that the colors are very detracting particularly the avocado color
- Suggested cultured stone on board might help
- Feels it needs a texture change and not stone
- Agreed that the avocado needed to be warmer

Boardmember Thompson

- Suggested cobble field stone be lighter
- Applicant clarified that it was removed and is all tilt up slab now
- Inquired if there is a way the center element can be made one. Applicant clarified there are two elements on top of panels
- Suggested to lighten the avocado color

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Likes the change in texture used on the project at US60 and Horne
- Stated the project at Dobson and Broadway is successful because of use of colors

Boardmember Candland

- Suggested using top caps to the sides for clarification similar to the US60 and Horne project

Staff will work with applicant to finalize design.

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
August 9, 2016**

Item A.5. DR16-023 Raising Cane’s Restaurant with Drive-thru

LOCATION/ADDRESS: 1930 S. Greenfield
REQUEST: Review of a rebuild for a restaurant with drive-thru
COUNCIL DISTRICT: 2
OWNER: Midfirst Bank
APPLICANT: Cameron Miller
ARCHITECT: Duncan J. Chang
STAFF PLANNER: Kim Steadman

Discussion: Staff member Kim Steadman presented the Board with an overview of the project.

Chair Banda

- Stated that the arch looks like it was cut off making it feel incomplete
- Feels it does not look right without the sign
- Suggested it needs an overhang
- Suggested the arch is too flush with facade
- Feels that the facade only works with signage or mural on the east elevation

Boardmember Carter

- Stated the pitched roofs do not belong
- Feels that the form is not bad, it just needs work

Boardmember Thompson

- Inquired if this is a new prototype
- Inquired if the drive-thru is covered
- Stated she likes the entry
- Clarified the color on canopies
- Suggested bringing the back tower element from other location and thicken up fascia cap on arch

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Stated he does not like the arch
- Feels the signage is most exciting part of the exterior design
- Suggested to thicken it up and then pull it out so it overhangs like an awning

Boardmember Candland

- Feels the addition of art to east side helps

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
August 9, 2016**

Staff will work with applicant to finalize design.

Item A.6. DR16-024 Burger King Restaurant with Drive-thru

LOCATION/ADDRESS: 10726 E. Guadalupe
REQUEST: Review of a restaurant with drive-thru
COUNCIL DISTRICT: 6
OWNER: Barnett Management Company
APPLICANT: Jackie Miller, One Architecture
ARCHITECT: Brad Flahiff, Barnett Management Company
STAFF PLANNER: Kim Steadman

Discussion: Staff member Kim Steadman presented the Board with an overview of the project.

Chair Banda

- Feels that the parapet roofing does not fall in line with the craftsman style
- Feels it is not reminiscent of craftsman
- Suggested to thicken up patio cover to be more like drive thru canopy
- Stated Craftsman has variety of colors
- Stated the nearby Fry's color palette reads well
- Feels the rendering does not read to color boards
- Feels it lacks bulkiness of craftsman
- Suggested using a mix of colors and not have all browns
- Suggested the tower element needs corbels

Boardmember Carter

- Feels that the roof slope on canopy is proportionally wrong and too shallow
- Suggested addition of something decorative on the windows
- Suggested a header or something
- Feels that the entry looks foreign to craftsman
- Feels that the drive-thru is successful and may be an option for other areas of the building

Boardmember Thompson

- Suggested more colors and textures from rest of the center
- Suggested changing the wainscoting

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Feels that the colors need clarification
- Suggested working on proportioning
- Suggested it needs more color.
- Suggested the tower element needs to come out from wall

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
August 9, 2016**

Staff will work with applicant to finalize design.

Item A.7. DR16-025 Light Rail Station

| | |
|--------------------------|--|
| LOCATION/ADDRESS: | 1235 E. Main Street |
| REQUEST: | Review for the future Light Rail Station |
| COUNCIL DISTRICT: | 4 |
| OWNER: | Jay Yenerich, Valley Metro |
| APPLICANT: | Andrew Haines, Jacobs Engineering |
| ARCHITECT: | Dan Marinaro, Wendell Companies |
| STAFF PLANNER: | Wahid Alam, AICP |

Continuance to September 13, 2016 Meeting

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
August 9, 2016**

Item A.8. DR16-026 Light Rail Station

| | |
|--------------------------|--|
| LOCATION/ADDRESS: | 1859 E. Main Street |
| REQUEST: | Review for the future Light Rail Station |
| COUNCIL DISTRICT: | 4 |
| OWNER: | Jay Yenerich, Valley Metro |
| APPLICANT: | Andrew Haines, Jacobs Engineering |
| ARCHITECT: | Dan Marinaro, Wendell Companies |
| STAFF PLANNER: | Wahid Alam, AICP |

Continuance to September 13, 2016 Meeting

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
August 9, 2016**

Item A.9. DR16-027 Retail Stores

LOCATION/ADDRESS: 4425 S. Mountain Road
REQUEST: Review of future retail stores
COUNCIL DISTRICT:
OWNER: Mountain Warner, LLC
APPLICANT: Lesley L. Partch, Functional Formation Architecture
ARCHITECT: Lesley L. Partch, Functional Formation Architecture
STAFF PLANNER: Misa Lozano

Discussion: Staff member Kim Steadman presented the Board with an overview of the project.

Chair Banda

- Likes the columns but suggested adding masonry or polished CMU to replace stacked stone
- Suggested not using box signs
- Inquired about the lighting on building
- Likes cut sheet provided

Boardmember Carter

- Agreed with Chair Banda not to use box signs and inquired if signage is intended to be within the box
- Suggested that a stipulation be that signage to remain within the box through Planning and Zoning Board

Boardmember Thompson

- Suggested instead of stone veneer the use of decorative panel CMU which appears like ceramic tile but it's stone.
- Likes precast columns
- Likes building but suggested the change of the one material

Staff will work with applicant to finalize design.

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
August 9, 2016**

B. Call to Order

Chair Banda called the meeting to order at 6:27 pm.

C. Consider the Minutes from the June 14, 2016 meeting

On a motion by Boardmember Thompson and seconded by Boardmember Sandstrom, the Board unanimously approved the June 14, 2016 minutes.

(Vote: 6-0, Absent, Boardmember Paul)

D. Adjournment

On a motion by Boardmember Sandstrom and seconded by Boardmember Candland, the Meeting was adjourned at 6:33 pm.

(Vote: 6-0, Absent, Boardmember Paul)